## Reconciliation of back-door and front-door adjustments

First, consider the case comparing the back-door adjustment for a typical back-door (below left) with a classic randomized design (below right), the backdoor adjustment applies consistently to each.


G


G

The back-door adjustment is

$$
\operatorname{Pr}(y \mid d o(x))=\sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x, z) \operatorname{Pr}(z) \quad \text { (back-door adj) }
$$

The DAG on the right implies action and observation of $X$ are equivalent

$$
\operatorname{Pr}(y \mid d o(x))=\operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x)=\sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x, z) \operatorname{Pr}(z \mid x)=\sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x, z) \operatorname{Pr}(z)
$$

The latter follows since $X$ and $Z$ are independent in the DAG.
Next, consider two front-door DAGs. The one on the left is the prototype but both satisfy the definition of a front-door.


G


G
[Definition] A set of variables $Z$ is defined a front-door for the ordered pair $(X, Y)$ if
(i) $Z$ intercepts all directed paths from $X$ to $Y$,
(ii) there is no unblocked back-door path from $X$ to $Z$, and
(iii) all back-door paths from $Z$ to $Y$ are blocked by $X$.

The front-door adjustment is

$$
\operatorname{Pr}(y \mid d o(x))=\sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(z \mid x) \sum_{x^{\prime}} \operatorname{Pr}\left(y \mid x^{\prime}, z\right) \operatorname{Pr}\left(x^{\prime}\right) \quad \text { (front-door adj) }
$$

As is the case with back-door adjustment, front-door adjustment reconciliation relies entirely on conditional independence rather than further appeal to do-calculus. For the front-door DAG on the right action is equivalent to observation $\operatorname{Pr}(y \mid d o(x))=\operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x)$. The key resides with the second summation and conditional independence of $X$ and $Y$ given $Z$.

$$
\sum_{x^{\prime}} \operatorname{Pr}\left(y \mid x^{\prime}, z\right) \operatorname{Pr}\left(x^{\prime}\right)=\sum_{x^{\prime}} \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid z) \operatorname{Pr}\left(x^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{Pr}(y \mid z)
$$

Then, combine with the first term and insert $X$ back into the conditioning and by Bayes' chain rule the reconciliation is complete.

$$
\sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(z \mid x) \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid z)=\sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(z \mid x) \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x, z)=\operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x)
$$

The final reconciliation involves the prototypical front-door DAG on the left. Suppose $U$ is measured. Then, the back-door adjustment identifies the causal effect of $X$ on $Y$.

$$
\operatorname{Pr}(y \mid d o(x))=\sum_{u} \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x, u) \operatorname{Pr}(u)
$$

There are two conditional independence relations to reconcile the right-hand side of the back-door adjustment with the right-hand side of the front-door adjustment (again, without further reference to do-calculus).

$$
\begin{gathered}
X \perp Y \mid Z, U \\
U \perp Z \mid X
\end{gathered}
$$

First, rewrite the back-door adjustment to include $Z$ with Bayes chain rule.

$$
\sum_{u} \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x, u) \operatorname{Pr}(u)=\sum_{u} \sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x, u, z) \operatorname{Pr}(z \mid x, u) \operatorname{Pr}(u)
$$

Now utilize the conditional independence conditions and rearrange.

$$
\sum_{u} \sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid x, u, z) \operatorname{Pr}(z \mid x, u) \operatorname{Pr}(u)=\sum_{u} \sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(z \mid x) \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid u, z) \operatorname{Pr}(u)
$$

Then, use Bayes chain rule along with conditional independence to insert $X^{\prime}$ in the last two terms.

$$
\begin{gathered}
\sum_{u} \sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(z \mid x) \operatorname{Pr}(y \mid u, z) \operatorname{Pr}(u) \\
=\sum_{u} \sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(z \mid x) \sum_{x^{\prime}} \operatorname{Pr}\left(y \mid x^{\prime}, u, z\right) \operatorname{Pr}\left(u \mid x^{\prime}, z\right) \operatorname{Pr}\left(x^{\prime}\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

Finally, summation over $U$ produces the front-door adjustment.

$$
\sum_{z} \operatorname{Pr}(z \mid x) \sum_{x^{\prime}} \operatorname{Pr}\left(y \mid x^{\prime}, z\right) \operatorname{Pr}\left(x^{\prime}\right)
$$

