

Ralph's random probability and variance

This is a continuation of Ralph's uncertain variance. Everything is the same except Ralph views the proposition probability p (that the state is favorable) as a random variable (in other words, Ralph is uncertain about the probability assignment for the proposition). Accordingly, Ralph believes $E[\log p] = E[\log 1 - p] = -1.96191$ (geometric mean $\exp(-1.96191) = 0.14059$) or, in other words, p has a beta distribution with concentration parameters $a = b = 0.3$.

Ralph knows Bayesian (sum and product rules) updating of the proposition probability based on conditionally normally distributed evidence (with a given variance) is

$$\begin{aligned} & f(p \mid y = 24; \sigma) \\ = & \frac{f(p, y = 24; \sigma)}{f(y = 24; \sigma)} \\ = & \frac{[pf(y = 24 \mid s = f) + (1 - p)f(y = 24 \mid s = u)]p^{a-1}(1 - p)^{b-1}}{\int_0^1 [pf(y = 24 \mid s = f) + (1 - p)f(y = 24 \mid s = u)]p^{a-1}(1 - p)^{b-1} dp} \end{aligned}$$

where $f(y \mid s)$ is a normal density function and the denominator is

$$f(y = 24; \sigma) = \beta(1 + a, b)f(y = 24 \mid s = f) + \beta(a, 1 + b)f(y = 24 \mid s = u)$$

and $\beta(a, b) = \frac{\Gamma(a)\Gamma(b)}{\Gamma(a+b)}$. Also,

$$\begin{aligned} & E[p \mid y = 24; \sigma] \\ = & \frac{\frac{1+a}{1+a+b}\beta(1 + a, b)f(y = 24 \mid s = f) + \frac{a}{1+a+b}\beta(a, 1 + b)f(y = 24 \mid s = u)}{f(y = 24; \sigma)} \end{aligned}$$

When the variance or standard deviation σ is also uncertain with kernel $\frac{1}{\sigma}$ Bayesian updating of the proposition probability is

$$\begin{aligned} & f(p \mid y = 24; 1 < \sigma < 3) \\ = & \frac{f(p, y = 24; 1 < \sigma < 3)}{f(y = 24; 1 < \sigma < 3)} \\ = & \frac{\int_1^3 \frac{1}{\sigma} [pf(y = 24 \mid s = f) + (1 - p)f(y = 24 \mid s = u)]p^{a-1}(1 - p)^{b-1} d\sigma}{\int_0^1 \int_1^3 \frac{1}{\sigma} [pf(y = 24 \mid s = f) + (1 - p)f(y = 24 \mid s = u)]p^{a-1}(1 - p)^{b-1} d\sigma dp} \end{aligned}$$

where the numerator is

$$\begin{aligned} f(p, y = 24; 1 < \sigma < 3) = & p^a(1 - p)^{b-1} \frac{\left[F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_f}{3}\right) - F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_f}{1}\right) \right]}{\mu_f - 24} \\ & + p^{a-1}(1 - p)^b \frac{\left[F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_u}{3}\right) - F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_u}{1}\right) \right]}{\mu_u - 24} \end{aligned}$$

$F(\cdot)$ is the cumulative standard normal distribution function, μ_j is the mean of y conditional on state j and the denominator is

$$f(y = 24; 1 < \sigma < 3) = \beta(1 + a, b) \frac{\left[F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_f}{3}\right) - F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_f}{1}\right) \right]}{\mu_f - 24} \\ + \beta(a, 1 = b) \frac{\left[F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_u}{3}\right) - F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_u}{1}\right) \right]}{\mu_u - 24}$$

And,

$$E[p | y = 24; 1 < \sigma < 3] \\ = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \frac{1+a}{1+a+b} \beta(1 + a, b) \frac{\left[F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_f}{3}\right) - F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_f}{1}\right) \right]}{\mu_f - 24} \\ + \frac{a}{1+a+b} \beta(a, 1 = b) \frac{\left[F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_u}{3}\right) - F\left(\frac{24 - \mu_u}{1}\right) \right]}{\mu_u - 24} \end{array} \right\} / f(y = 24; 1 < \sigma < 3)$$

Suggested:

1. Verify via maximum entropy probability assignment the kernel for p is $p^{-0.7} (1 - p)^{-0.7}$.

2. Derive the density function for proposition probability given the evidence $f(p | y = 24; \sigma)$ and expected value $E[p | y = 24; \sigma]$ if σ is assigned 1 or if σ is assigned 3.

3. Derive the density function for proposition probability given the evidence $f(p | y = 24; 1 < \sigma < 3)$ and expected value $E[p | y = 24; 1 < \sigma < 3]$ if σ is assigned density $\frac{1}{\sigma}$ with support between 1 and 3.

4. How do these results compare with those in Ralph's uncertain variance?