# Selection of fungal isolates for virulence against three aphid pest species of crucifers and okra 

W. Bayissa ${ }^{1,2}$ - S. Ekesi ${ }^{1}$ - S. A. Mohamed ${ }^{1} \cdot$ G. P. Kaaya ${ }^{2}$ • J. M. Wagacha ${ }^{2}$ • R. Hanna ${ }^{3}$ • N. K. Maniania ${ }^{1}$

Received: 16 November 2015/Revised: 14 May 2016/Accepted: 25 May 2016/Published online: 4 June 2016
© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2016


#### Abstract

Aphids are regarded as important pest problems of vegetable crops worldwide. Most vegetable growers in sub-Saharan Africa heavily rely on synthetic chemical insecticides for aphids' control. Fungus-based biopesticides are being considered as alternatives to chemical insecticides. This study evaluates virulence of five isolates of Metarhizium anisopliae and three of Beauveria bassiana against Brevicoryne brassicae, Lipaphis pseudobrassicae, and Aphis gossypii, and their thermotolerance and conidial yield as a prerequisite for strain selection. The study also evaluates performance of the best isolate in screenhouse experiment against target aphid species. Three isolates of M. anisopliae ICIPE30, ICIPE62, and ICIPE69 outperformed the others, causing mortality of 85-98 \%, 83-97 \%, and $73-77 \%$, in B. brassicae, L. pseudobrassicae, and A. gossypii, respectively, 7 days post-inoculation. Isolate ICIPE62 had the shortest $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ values of $3.4,2.5$, and 2.6 days at $1 \times 10^{8}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$, and the lowest $\mathrm{LC}_{50}$ values of $7.3 \times 10^{5}, 9.3 \times 10^{4}$, and $3.0 \times 10^{4}$ conidia ml $^{-1}$ on day 7 against A. gossypii, B. brassicae, and L. pseudobrassicae, respectively. Furthermore, ICIPE62 produced more conidia on the surface of aphid cadavers than ICIPE30 and ICIPE69 and showed wider thermotolerance with


Communicated by E. Quesada-Moraga.

[^0]optimum ranges between 25 and $30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. Application of conidia of ICIPE62 formulated in aqueous and emulsifiable formulations negatively affected aphid population growth rate on kale and okra plants compared to controls in screenhouse experiments. These results have demonstrated the potential of M. anisopliae isolate ICIPE62 in suppression of A. gossypii, B. brassicae, and L. pseudobrassicae populations and could therefore be considered as biopesticide candidate for the control of these target aphids.

Keywords Entomopathogenic • Fungi • Pathogenicity • Thermotolerance • Formulation

## Key messages

- Several isolates of B. bassiana and M. anisopliae were screened for selection of isolate(s) that are virulent against three aphid pests infesting vegetables in subSaharan Africa.
- M. anisopliae isolate ICIPE62 outperformed the other isolates in terms of virulence against the three aphid pests conidial production and thermotolerance.
- Aqueous and emulsifiable formulations of M. anisopliae ICIPE62 provided acceptable control of the three aphid species in the screenhouse.


## Introduction

Globally, aphids (Hemiptera: Aphididae) are regarded as one of the most important insect pests of vegetable crops causing direct feeding damage on plant sap, excretion of honeydew that may favor the growth of molds and
transmission of plant viruses (Van Emden and Harrington 2007). In Africa, the cabbage aphid Brevicoryne brassicae (L.)—restricted to mid- and high-altitude agroecologiesand the turnip aphid Lipaphis pseudobrassicae (Davis)restricted to mid- and low-land agroecologies-cause considerable yield losses of up to $100 \%$ on many cruciferous crops (e.g., cabbage, kale) if not controlled (Nyambo and Löhr 2005; Sæthre et al. 2011; Waiganjo et al. 2011). The cabbage aphid is known to transmit 23 plant viruses, of which Cauliflower mosaic virus (CaMV) and Turnip mosaic virus occur in tropical Africa and can cause substantial reduction in cabbage production (Spence et al. 2007). In Kenya, survey of farmers perception on insect problems of kale and cabbage revealed that 89-97 \% of the growers ranked aphids (B. brassicae and L. pseudobrassicae) as the major insect pest threat to the two crops (Oruku and Ndung'u 2001). In addition to these two aphid species, the melon/cotton aphid, Aphis gossypii (Glover), is also considered as one of the most serious pests on a broad array of vegetables in tropical Africa. For example in Kenya, yield losses due to A. gossypii on okra were estimated at 15-40 \% (Sithanantham et al. 1997). Aphis gossypii can transmit more than 50 plant viruses causing symptoms that impair vegetable quality and yield.

In many African countries, the management of these aphid species relies heavily on application of synthetic chemical insecticides. Majority of vegetable growers who are smallholders with limited knowledge of pesticide use frequently apply cocktail of synthetic chemical insecticides (Williamson et al. 2008; Zalucki et al. 2012). This practice substantially elevates production costs, increases health risks of producers and consumers, and most often disrupts the activity of natural enemies that otherwise could contribute to keeping the aphids under control, in addition to the development of resistance to these chemicals (Aktar et al. 2009; Amoabeng et al. 2013). Therefore, exploring nonchemical alternatives for controlling aphids is fundamental to realizing sustainable vegetable production, especially among the smallholder farmers in the region.

Aphids are known to be attacked by a number of natural enemies including entomopathogenic fungi (EPF) which sometimes cause epizootics in their populations (Wraight and Hajek 2009). Among the EPF, Hypocreales of the anamorphic genera (Beauveria, Metarhizium, Isaria, and Lecanicillium) are best suited for development as biopesticides compared to Entomophthorales which are highly specialized and difficult to mass production. They involve parasitic, hemibiotrophic (i.e., phase in insect haemocoel), and saprophytic phases (Hesketh et al. 2010; Wraight and Hajek 2009) that are amenable to mass production on various organic substrates such as rice, maize, and sorghum among others. In Europe and North

America, several commercial products based on Metarhizium brunneum (Petch), Beauveria bassiana (Bals.) Vuill., and Isaria spp. have been registered for aphid control. They include BotaniGard ${ }^{\circledR}$ and Naturalis-L ${ }^{\circledR}$ (B. bassiana-based products), Met52 ${ }^{\circledR}$ (M. brunneumbased product), Preferal ${ }^{\circledR}$ (Isaria spp-based product), and Vertalec ${ }^{\circledR}$ (Lecanicillium longisporum R. Zare \& W. Gams-based product) (Jandricic et al. 2014; Kabaluk et al. 2010; Ravensberg 2011). Similar products are not available on the African continent. In Africa, there is lack of guidance on the import and release of biocontrol agents and, thus, the decision not to import nonindigenous biocontrol agents because of fear of the potential impact of an unknown pest (Cherry and Gwynn 2007). It is, therefore, logical to identify virulent indigenous fungal isolates against aphids for further development as biocontrol agents by local private companies.

Since the ability of EPF to cause disease in insect populations is influenced by a number of factors including abiotic factors (Benz 1987; Hall and Papierok 1982; Inglis et al. 2001), the effect of environmental factor must be assessed in order to predict their efficacy in the field. Temperature, humidity, and solar radiation are among the abiotic factors that affect the EPF action (Inglis et al. 2001). Among these factors, temperature is considered as the most important as it affects the pathogen (conidial germination, growth), insect development, and virulence against the insects (Benz 1987; Fargues and Bon 2004; Maniania and Fargues 1992). The first objective of the present study is therefore to screen fungal isolates for selection of virulent ones against aphid species, B. brassicae, L. pseudobrassicae, and A. gossypii. The second objective is to assess the effect of constant temperatures on conidial germination, mycelial growth, and virulence of selected fungal isolates with the goal of selected fungal isolates to choose a desired candidate that is effective against the three target pests at a broad range of temperatures. We also evaluated the performance of two formulations of the best isolate against the three aphid species in the screenhouse.

## Materials and methods

## Insects

The stock cultures of aphids (B. brassicae, L. pseudobrassicae, and A. gossypii) came from field populations infesting cabbage, kale, and okra in vegetable production sites of Nyeri, Kenya ( $0^{\circ} 21^{\prime} 10.69^{\prime \prime}$ S $37^{\circ} 5^{\prime} 14.35^{\prime \prime}$, 1878 m.a.s.l), and Nguruman, Kenya ( $1^{\circ} 48^{\prime} 22.1^{\prime \prime} \mathrm{S} 36^{\circ} 03^{\prime} 41.2^{\prime \prime} \mathrm{E}, 746$ m.a.s.l). The aphids were reared on at least 3-week-old kale (var. 1000 headed) and okra (var. Pusa sawani) potted plants (4-5
leaves) in the insectary at $27-28^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and photoperiod of 12:12 L:D. Laboratory-reared colonies were rejuvenated every 3 months by introducing field populations of the same aphid species to maintain genetic vigor. To obtain insects of the same developmental stage for use in bioassays, apterous adult aphids of each species were removed from laboratory-reared colonies using camel brush and maintained on fresh kale or okra leaves in $90-\mathrm{mm}$ Petri dishes to larviposit for 24 h and adults were removed thereafter. The newly born nymphs were then transferred to fresh seedlings and maintained until adult stage ready for use in the bioassay.

## Fungal isolates

Fungal isolates used in this study were obtained from the icipe Arthropod Germplasm Centre where they were stored at $-80^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. The origin of the fungal isolates and the year of their isolation are presented in Table 1. They were cultured on Sabouraud dextrose agar (SDA) and maintained at $26 \pm 2{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ in darkness. Virulence of each fungal isolate was maintained by regular passages through the target insects. Conidia were harvested from 2- to 3-weekold sporulating cultures and suspended in $10 \mathrm{ml} 0.05 \%$ Triton X-100 in universal bottles containing glass beads ( 3 mm ). The suspension was vortexed for 5 min at 100 rpm to break the conidial clumps and ensure a homogeneous suspension. Conidia were quantified using haemocytometer under light microscope. For viability test, concentration of $3 \times 10^{6}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ was prepared and 0.1 ml of the suspension was evenly spread on SDA and three sterile microscope cover slips were placed randomly on the surface of each inoculated plate. The plates were sealed with Parafilm and incubated under complete darkness at $26 \pm 2{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. Conidia germination was assessed after 18 h by counting 100 conidia beneath each coverslip under a light microscope.

## Pathogenicity of fungal isolates against three aphid pests

Five isolates of M. anisopliae and three of B. bassiana were screened against the three aphid species. Twenty 2-day-old apterous adult aphids of each species were transferred on fresh leaf disks (ca. 80 mm diameter) of kale for B. brassicae and L. pseudobrassicae, and okra for A. gossypii in a $90-\mathrm{mm}$ Petri dish. Insects were allowed to settle on the host plants and were then sprayed with 10 ml of $1 \times 10^{8}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ suspension using a Burgerjon's spray tower (Burgejon 1956). Air atomizing nozzle with a valve providing a constant airflow under 4 bar pressure fitted to the Burgerjon's spray tower resulting to suspension deposit of approximately $3.9 \times 10^{7}$ conidia $\mathrm{cm}^{-2}$. Rotating plate fitted underneath of the tower also ensure even distribution of the suspension on the surface of the insects. The control groups were sprayed with sterile water containing $0.05 \%$ Triton X-100. After treatment, embedded leaf disks containing aphids were allowed to dry (for approx. 5 min ). The aphids were then transferred to fresh unsprayed surface-sterilized leaf disks (ca. 100 mm diameter). Prior to transferring treated insects, leaf disks were washed with tap water, surface sterilized with $0.01 \%$ sodium hypochlorite ( 5 min ) and thoroughly rinsed in distilled sterile water ( 5 min ), and transferred to sterile laminar airflow hood and air-dried to remove excessive moisture. Both control and fungus-treated insects were transferred to a humid plastic box $(40 \times 120 \mathrm{~mm})$ lined with moistened filter paper and incubated at $26 \pm 2{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. All the fungal isolates were bioassayed concurrently against the three aphid species and each treatment replicated four times over time. Treatments were arranged in a completely randomized design blocks. Aphid mortality was recorded daily for 7 days post-treatment. The dead insects were surface sterilized with $70 \%$ alcohol and then rinsed thrice in sterile distilled water. They were kept separately in a

Table 1 List, origin and percentage germination of fungal isolates tested against three adult aphid species on SDA plates after 18 h at $26 \pm 2{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$

| Fungal species | Fungal isolate | Source of origin | Site (Country of origin) | Year of isolation | \% germination $\pm \mathrm{SE}^{\mathrm{a}}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| B. bassiana | ICIPE 10 | Soil | Mbita (Kenya) | 2002 | $95.5 \pm 0.3 \mathrm{ab}$ |
|  | ICIPE 273 | Soil | Mbita (Kenya) | 2006 | $91.4 \pm 2.1 \mathrm{~b}$ |
|  | ICIPE 279 | Coleopteran larvae | Kericho (Kenya) | 2005 | $93.1 \pm 1.2 \mathrm{~b}$ |
| M. anisopliae | ICIPE 18 | Soil | Mbita (Kenya) | 1989 | $98.1 \pm 0.3 \mathrm{a}$ |
|  | ICIPE 30 | Busseola fusca | Kendubay (Kenya) | 1989 | $98.9 \pm 0.5 \mathrm{a}$ |
|  | ICIPE 62 | Soil | Matete (D.R. Congo) | 1990 | $99.3 \pm 0.1 \mathrm{a}$ |
|  | ICIPE 69 | Soil | Matete (D.R. Congo) | 1990 | $99.8 \pm 0.3 \mathrm{a}$ |
|  | ICIPE 78 | Temnoschoita nigroplagiata | Ungoe (Kenya) | 1990 | $99.1 \pm 0.3 \mathrm{a}$ |

[^1]Petri dish lined with sterile moistened filter paper for fungal outgrowth to verify if their deaths were attributed to mycosis.

## Concentration-mortality response

Metarhizium anisopliae isolates ICIPE 30, ICIPE 62, and ICIPE 69 had the lowest $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ values against the three aphid species in the screening tests and were, therefore, selected for concentration-mortality response assays using the following concentrations: $1 \times 10^{4}, 1 \times 10^{5}, 1 \times 10^{6}$, $1 \times 10^{7}$, and $1 \times 10^{8}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$. Suspensions were prepared as described above and different concentrations were obtained through serial dilutions. Cohorts of each adult apterous aphid species were placed on their respective host plant leaves (kale or okra) as described earlier and were sprayed with 10 ml of each concentration using Burgerjon spray tower. The control groups were sprayed with sterile distilled water containing $0.05 \%$ Triton X-100. Twenty apterous adult aphids were used per replicate and per dose for each isolate and aphid species. Treated aphids were maintained as described above and mortality recorded daily for 7 days. Treatments were randomized and repeated three times. Dead insects were processed following the procedures described above.

## Conidia production on aphid cadaver

To evaluate conidiation capacity on aphid cadavers killed by M. anisopliae ICIPE 30, ICIPE 62, and ICIPE 69 at $1 \times 10^{8}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$, three cadavers of each aphid species from each replicate were maintained for 3,6 , and 9 days under optimal conditions for the fungal isolates. Sporulated cadavers were dried at $30 \pm 2{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for 30 min and then individually transferred into 1 ml aliquots of $0.05 \%$ Triton $\mathrm{X}-100$ in tubes. The tubes were vortexed for 5 min to dislodge conidia and conidial concentration from each cadaver was determined using a hemocytometer (Niassy et al. 2012).

## Effect of temperature on germination of selected fungal isolates

The three selected M. anisopliae isolates were further evaluated for the effect of constant temperatures on conidial germination. Conidia were harvested as described above and concentration of $3 \times 10^{6}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ was prepared. Conidial suspension ( 0.1 ml ) was spread-plated on SDA plates and sterile microscopic cover slips placed on each plate. The plates were sealed with Parafilm membrane and later incubated at $10,15,20,25,30$, and $35^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ in darkness. After 18 h post-inoculation, conidial germination was halted using 1 ml formaldehyde ( $0.5 \%$ )
and the plates were assessed for germination as described above. The experiment was replicated four times for each temperature and fungal isolate.

## Effect of temperature on radial growth

To assess the effect of temperature on radial growth, 0.1 ml spore suspension of each isolate ICIPE 30, 62, and 69 titrated to $3 \times 10^{6}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ was evenly spread on SDA and allowed to grow for 3 days to obtain mycelial mats. Plugs (ca. 5 mm ) of mycelium were cut from the plates using an 8 -mm-diameter cork borer and placed upside down at the center of a $90-\mathrm{mm}$ Petri dish containing sterile SDA. The plates were sealed with Parafilm membrane and incubated for 12 days in the conditions described above. Four replicate were used for each isolate and temperature combination. The radial growth was measured every other day using two cardinal diameters drawn on the bottom of each plate.

## Effect of temperature on virulence

Thirty apterous adult aphids of each species were treated with 10 ml of conidial suspension titrated to $1 \times 10^{8}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ using Burgerjon spray tower and insects were handled as described earlier. Aphis gossypii and L. pseudobrassicae were incubated at $15,20,25,30$, and $35^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, while B. brassicae at $10,15,20,25$ and $30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ since it is largely a highland pest. All the treatment combinations were arranged in a complete randomized design with four replicates. Mortality was recorded daily for 5 days. Dead insects were placed on Petri dish lined with moist filter paper as described above. Mycosis was confirmed by examining the surface of the cadaver under a microscope as described earlier.

## Screenhouse experiment

Based on the results from virulence, thermotolerance and conidial production on cadavers, M. anisopliae ICIPE 62 was selected for screenhouse experiments. Kale and okra were planted in plastic pots $(15 \times 20 \mathrm{~cm})$ by direct seeding. Plants were thinned to one plant per pot when they were ca. 20 cm tall and transferred into sleeved cages $(100 \times 100 \mathrm{~cm})$. Each caged plant was then artificially infested with 100 apterous adult aphids of uniform age and transferred into a screenhouse ( $5 \times 10 \mathrm{~m}$ ) thereafter. The prevailing temperature and HR in the screenhouse during the experiments ranged from 15 to $29^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and 30 to $90 \%$ RH, respectively, under 12:12 L:D photoperiod. The insects were allowed to multiply for 8 days and to ensure that they reach a stable age distribution (Banken 1996), basis on which different values for rates of increase can be
compared (Birch 1948). The initial aphid density $\left(N_{0}\right)$ before fungus application was determined by destructive sampling of five plants for each species. For each aphid species, treatments were arranged in completely randomized design and replicated four times. Conidial suspension titrated to $1.0 \times 10^{8}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ was formulated in water (Triton X-100 + Water at the ratio of $0.05: 99.95$ ) and emulsifiable formulation (Triton X-100 + Corn Oil + Water at the ratio of 0.05:0.1:99.85). Nutrient agar (0.1 \%), glycerin $(0.1 \%)$, and molasses $(0.5 \%)$ were added to each formulation as protectants to complete the formulations (Maniania 1993). Each infested plant was then sprayed with 20 ml of each formulation using a hand sprayer fitted with a hollow cone nozzle with a volume diameter droplet of $41 \mu \mathrm{~m}$. Control cohorts were treated with either sterile water containing $0.05 \%$ Triton X-100 or $0.1 \%$ oil plus the protectant ingredients listed above. Treatments were performed late in the evening to lessen the adverse effect of ultraviolet radiation (Moore and Prior 1993). The efficacy of fungus application on aphids was based on mortality caused by the fungus on randomly selected aphid samples and aphid population growth rate (Birch 1948). Twenty apterous adult aphids were gently picked at random using a camel hair brush from treated plants and placed individually in screened transparent plastic vials ( $50 \times 100 \mathrm{~mm}$ ) and fed with surface-sterilized kale or okra leaf disks. Insects were maintained in a controlled environment room ( $26 \pm 2{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}, 60 \pm 5 \% \mathrm{RH}$, and photoperiod of 12:12 L:D). Mortality was recorded daily for 7 days and dead insects were processed as described above. To determine aphid population growth rate on the potted plants following spray application of the fungus, all potted plants were removed from the cages after 7 days and all the aphids on the plants counted. The time interval of 7 days was chosen because it provided enough time for population growth to occur, but not enough time for the aphids to kill the plants.

## Statistical analysis

Percent aphid mortality was corrected for control mortality using Abbott's formula (Abbott 1925) and arcsine squareroot transformed (Gomez and Gomez 1984) before analysis of variance (ANOVA). Mean comparisons among aphid species, fungal species, and/or isolates were made using Tukey HSD test. Lethal time to $50 \%$ mortality $\left(\mathrm{LT}_{50}\right)$ values were estimated with repeated measures logistic regression using generalized estimating equations (Stokes et al. 2000). This was carried out using Genmod of SAS procedure (SAS 1999a, b-2001). Lethal concentration to $50 \%$ mortality $\left(\mathrm{LC}_{50}\right)$ and slope were estimated by probit analysis for correlation data (Throne et al. 1995) using SAS software. Tests of parallelism of probit regression lines for
all isolates were performed using $\chi^{2}$ statistics goodness-offit test.

Data on percent germination of fungal isolates were subjected to generalized linear (GLM) using binomial regression analysis. Whenever overdispersion was detected, data fitted to quasibinomial regression model. Radial growth data were fitted by regression analysis $(y=v t+b)$, and then the linear regression slope $(v)$, which indicated the growth rates (velocity in $\mathrm{mm}^{-1}$ ), used as the main parameter to evaluate the influence of temperature on fungal growth (Fargues et al. 1992; Ouedraogo et al. 1997; Yeo et al. 2003; Davidson et al. 2003). Means were separated using Tukey HSD test.

Furthermore, linear and nonlinear (Briere-1) models were used to estimate the effect of temperature on fungal growth. The linear model expressed as $y(t)=a+b t$ was used to estimate the relationship between relevant temperatures and growth rate of fungal isolates, where $y$ is the rate of growth, $t$ is ambient temperature, and intercept (a) and slope (b) as the model parameters. The minimum temperature ( $T_{\min }$ ) was determined using the inverse slope of the fitted linear regression line as the $x$-intercept $(-a / b)$, and is the estimated lower temperature at which either no measurable growth occurs or zero (Campbell et al. 1974). On the other hand, the Briere-1 model was used for estimation of temperatures (minimum, maximum, and optimum) for fungal growth thresholds (Briere et al. 1999).

Count data on conidial production were checked for normality and homogeneity of variance using ShapiroWilk and Bartlett's tests before analysis. After normality test, data were fitted to GLM using negative binomial regression analysis. Negative binomial distribution was preferred for its appropriateness in handling the overdispersed conidial count data.

In the Screenhouse trial, the data on aphid numbers/plant were fitted to GLM model using negative binomial regression analysis. The final and initial aphid numbers/plant were compared using multiple comparisons based on the model parameter estimates. The aphid population growth rate was also determined as the instantaneous rate of increase $\left(r_{\mathrm{i}}\right)$ for each treatment using the equation:
$r_{i}=\frac{\ln \left(N_{t} / N_{0}\right)}{t}$,
where $N_{0}$ is the initial number of aphids in the population, and $N_{t}$ is the number of aphids in the population at the end of the time interval, $t$ (in days) (Walthall and Stark 1997; Stark and Banks 2003). "Positive values of $r_{\mathrm{i}}$ indicate a growing population; when $r_{\mathrm{i}}$ is zero, the population is neither growing nor declining, and when $r_{\mathrm{i}}$ is negative, the population is on the decline and headed towards extinction" (Stark and Banks 2003). The data on $r_{\mathrm{i}}$ were subjected to ANOVA and means were compared using Tukey

HSD test. All data analyses were done using R v2.15.1 statistical software package (R Development Core Team 2011) except for $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ and LC50.

## Results

## Pathogenicity of fungal isolates against aphid species

The percent germination for each isolate was greater than $90 \%$ after 18 h incubation at $26 \pm 2^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and was considered as acceptable (Table 1). Control mortalities in the initial screening ranged from 15 to $20 \%$ across the three aphid species. At a standard concentration of $1 \times 10^{8}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$, there was a significant difference between fungal species $(F=65.2$, df $=1,69 ; P<0.0001)$ and fungal isolates $(F=14.48, \mathrm{df}=7,69 ; P<0.0001)$. There were also significant differences in interactions between fungal species and insect species $(F=11.29, \mathrm{df}=2,69$; $P<0.0001$ ) and between fungal isolates and insect species ( $F=4.69$, df $=14,69 ; P<0.0001$ ) (Table 2). M. anisopliae isolates were more pathogenic to the aphid species than $B$. bassiana isolates, causing mortality ranging from 72.0 to $98.3 \%, 74.3$ to $96.8 \%$, and 61.9 to $77.0 \%$ in B. brassicae, L. pseudobrassicae, and A. gossypii, respectively, 7 days post-treatment (Table 2). The lethal time required to achieve $50 \%$ mortality $\left(\mathrm{LT}_{50}\right)$ among aphid species also varied with fungal isolates (Table 2). $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ values varied between 2.5 and 5.5 days in B. brassicae, between 2.6 and 5.2 days in L. pseudobrassicae, and between 2.8 and 5.6 days in A. gossypii. M. anisopliae isolate ICIPE 62 had the shortest $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ values against A. gossypii, B. brassicae, and L. pseudobrassicae, while
B. bassiana isolate ICIPE 279 had the shortest against A. gossypii. The $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ value for isolate ICIPE 279 was not computed against $L$. pseudobrassicae since mortality was less than $50 \%$ after 7 days post-treatment (Table 2). Based on $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ values across the three aphid species, M. anisopliae isolates ICIPE 30, ICIPE 62, and ICIPE 69 were selected for further studies.

## Concentration-mortality response

Among the three isolates (ICIPE 30, ICIPE 62, and ICIPE 69) tested for lethal concentration $50 \%$ mortality, isolate ICIPE 62 had the lowest $\mathrm{LC}_{50}$ values of $9.3 \times 10^{4}$, $3.0 \times 10^{4}$, and $7.3 \times 10^{5}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ to $B$. brassicae, L. pseudobrassicae, and A. gossypii, respectively, on day 7 (Table 3). Based upon the calculated potency ratio, both ICIPE 30 and 69 were less potent compared to ICIPE 62 against all the three aphid species (Table 3). Furthermore, the parallelism tests for the three isolates against each aphid species were as follows: B. brassicae $\left(\chi^{2}=1.03\right.$, $\mathrm{df}=2, P>0.05)$, L. pseudobrassicae $\left(\chi^{2}=0.34 ; \mathrm{df}=2\right.$; $P>0.05)$, and A. gossypii ( $\chi^{2}=1.02 ; \mathrm{df}=2 ; P>0.05$ ).

## Conidial production

The conidial production significantly varied according to isolates and insect species ( $\chi^{2}=35.13, \mathrm{df}=4 ; P<0.0001$ ), isolates and days ( $\chi^{2}=31.65$, df $=4 ; P<0.0001$ ), and isolates, insect species, and days $\left(\chi^{2}=85.69, \mathrm{df}=8\right.$; $P<0.0001$ ) (Fig. 1a-c). Across aphid species and fungal isolates, conidial production increased with increasing number of days. For example, the conidial production ranged from $4.9 \times 10^{5}$ to $3.9 \times 10^{6}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ on day $3,3.2 \times 10^{6}-$

Table 2 Pathogenicity of isolates of M. anisopliae and B. bassiana to apterous adult B. brassicae, L. pseudobrassicae, and A. gossypii following exposure to $1 \times 10^{8}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ after 7 days: percentage mortality and $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ values

| Fungal species | Isolate | Brevicoryne brassicae |  | Lipaphis pseudobrassicae |  | Aphis gossypii |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | \% Mortality $\pm$ SE | $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ (days) (95 \% FL) | \% Mortality $\pm$ SE | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{LT}_{50} \text { (days) } \\ & (95 \% \mathrm{FL}) \end{aligned}$ | \% Mortality $\pm$ SE | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{LT}_{50} \text { (days) } \\ & (95 \% \mathrm{FL}) \end{aligned}$ |
| M. anisopliae | ICIPE 18 | $77.5 \pm 3.2 \mathrm{bcA}$ | 3.8 (2.9-4.8) | $74.3 \pm 11.8 \mathrm{bAB}$ | 4.6 (3.9-5.4) | $61.9 \pm 4.5 \mathrm{bcB}$ | 5.8 (5.6-6.1) |
|  | ICIPE 30 | $98.3 \pm 1.7 \mathrm{aA}$ | 3.6 (3.4-3.7) | $96.8 \pm 3.2 \mathrm{aA}$ | 3.6 (3.3-4.0) | $72.6 \pm 6.0 \mathrm{aB}$ | 4.4 (3.9-5.0) |
|  | ICIPE 62 | $85.3 \pm 2.2 \mathrm{abB}$ | 2.5 (2.2-2.8) | $92.3 \pm 3.5 \mathrm{abA}$ | 2.6 (1.6-3.7) | $77.0 \pm 7.8 \mathrm{abB}$ | 3.4 (3.1-3.7) |
|  | ICIPE 69 | $86.6 \pm 2.0 \mathrm{abA}$ | 3.2 (2.7-3.7) | $82.6 \pm 13.8 \mathrm{abAB}$ | 2.8 (1.6-4.1) | $74.1 \pm 5.8 \mathrm{abB}$ | 5.0 (4.3-5.7) |
|  | ICIPE 78 | $72.0 \pm 6.5 \mathrm{bcB}$ | 3.9 (3.5-4.8) | $95.5 \pm 3.0 \mathrm{aA}$ | 3.1 (2.7-6.3) | $66.5 \pm 8.1 \mathrm{bcB}$ | 5.6 (4.7-6.4) |
| B. bassiana | ICIPE 10 | $68.5 \pm 6.8 \mathrm{cdA}$ | 5.4 (4.9-5.9) | $64.3 \pm 6.7 \mathrm{bA}$ | 5.2 (4.5-6.0) | $57.4 \pm 1.8 \mathrm{cdB}$ | 5.6 (5.2-6.0) |
|  | ICIPE 273 | $52.0 \pm 1.4 \mathrm{~dB}$ | 5.5 (5.1-5.9) | $61.0 \pm 4.9 \mathrm{bA}$ | 4.3 (3.8-4.9) | $57.3 \pm 1.9 \mathrm{dAB}$ | 5.4 (4.7-6.0) |
|  | ICIPE 279 | $75.9 \pm 0.3 \mathrm{bcA}$ | 5.3 (5.2-5.4) | $32.8 \pm 3.8 \mathrm{cB}$ | - | $77.1 \pm 7.7 \mathrm{bcA}$ | 3.3 (2.9-3.6) |

[^2]Table 3 LC $_{50}$ values for selected isolates of M. anisopliae and their relative potency of against apterous adult aphid pests at 7 days posttreatment

| Aphid species | M. anisopliae <br> isolates | $\mathrm{LC}_{50}\left(\right.$ Conidia ml $\left.^{-1}\right)(95 \% \mathrm{FL})^{\mathrm{a}}$ | Relative <br> potency $^{\mathrm{b}}$ | Slope $^{\mathrm{c}} \pm \mathrm{SE}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| B. brassicae | ICIPE 30 | $9.4 \times 10^{5}\left(3.3 \times 10^{5}-2.7 \times 10^{6}\right)$ | 0.10 | $1.6 \pm 0.2$ |
|  | ICIPE 62 | $9.3 \times 10^{4}\left(2.8 \times 10^{4}-2.7 \times 10^{5}\right)$ | 1.00 | $1.6 \pm 0.2$ |
| L. pseudobrassicae | ICIPE 69 | $1.2 \times 10^{6}\left(4.2 \times 10^{5}-3.4 \times 10^{6}\right)$ | 0.08 | $1.5 \pm 0.2$ |
|  | ICIPE 30 | $4.4 \times 10^{6}\left(1.4 \times 10^{6}-1.6 \times 10^{7}\right)$ | 0.01 | $1.5 \pm 0.2$ |
|  | ICIPE 62 | $3.0 \times 10^{4}\left(6.4 \times 10^{3}-1.2 \times 10^{5}\right)$ | 1.00 | $1.8 \pm 0.2$ |
| A. gossypii | ICIPE 69 | $7.8 \times 10^{5}\left(2.3 \times 10^{5}-2.5 \times 10^{6}\right)$ | 0.04 | $1.5 \pm 0.2$ |
|  | ICIPE 30 | $3.5 \times 10^{6}\left(1.0 \times 10^{6}-1.3 \times 10^{7}\right)$ | 0.20 | $1.6 \pm 0.2$ |
|  | ICIPE 62 | $7.3 \times 10^{5}\left(2.1 \times 10^{5}-2.5 \times 10^{6}\right)$ | 1.00 | $1.5 \pm 0.2$ |
|  | ICIPE 69 | $2.1 \times 10^{7}\left(5.7 \times 10^{6}-1.0 \times 10^{8}\right)$ | 0.04 | $1.6 \pm 0.2$ |

${ }^{a}$ Values in the bracket represent $95 \%$ Fiducial Limits (FL)
${ }^{\mathrm{b}} \mathrm{LC}_{50}$ value of ICIPE 62 divided by the $\mathrm{LC}_{50}$ value of a particular isolate
${ }^{c}$ Non-parallel probit models $\pm$ standard error (SE)
$1.3 \times 10^{7}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ on day 6 , and $8.8 \times 10^{6}-1.2 \times 10^{7}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ on day 9 post-treatment (Fig. 1a-c). On day 6 post-treatment, isolate ICIPE 62 produced higher number of conidia across aphid species compared to the other isolates. On day 9 post-infection, isolate ICIPE 62 outperfomed the other isolates, except ICIPE 30 that produced higher conidia ( $8.8 \times 10^{6}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ ) on A. gossypii than the other isolates (Fig. 1a-c).

## Effect of temperature on conidial germination

Conidia of the three isolates of M. anisopliae germinated at all the temperatures tested (ranging from 1.5 to $100 \%$ ), except at $10{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ where no germination was observed after 18 h post-incubation (Fig. 2). Fungal isolates ( $F=23.67$; $\mathrm{df}=2,57 ; P<0.0001)$ and temperatures $(F=595.72$; $\mathrm{df}=4,53 ; P<0.0001$ ) significantly affected conidial germination. For example, significant difference was observed in germination among the isolates at $15{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ $(F=13.20 ; \mathrm{df}=2,9 ; P=0.002)$ and $35^{\circ} \mathrm{C}(F=80.63$; $\mathrm{df}=2,9 ; P=0.0001$ ). The interaction between temperatures and isolates were also significant $(F=4.98 ; \mathrm{df}=8$, 45; $P<0.001$ ). However, there was no significant difference among the fungal isolates at $20^{\circ} \mathrm{C}(F=0.02$; df $=2$, $9 ; P=0.9805), 25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}(F=2.35 ; \mathrm{df}=2,9 ; P=0.1511)$, and $30{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}(F=1.23$; df $=2,9 ; P=0.3363)$. The optimal temperatures for conidial germination were observed at 25 and $30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for all the three isolates (Fig. 2).

## Effect of temperature on fungal growth

The results showed significant differences in growth among the three fungal isolates at $15{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}(F=16.09$; df $=2,9$; $P=0.0011), 20^{\circ} \mathrm{C}(F=55.37 ; \mathrm{df}=2,9 ; P<0.0001)$,
$25^{\circ} \mathrm{C} \quad(F=74.87 ; \quad \mathrm{df}=2, \quad 9 ; \quad P<0.0001), \quad 30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ $(F=102.64 ; \quad \mathrm{df}=2, \quad 9 ; \quad P<0.0001), \quad$ and $\quad 35^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ( $F=22.49$; df $=2,9 ; P=0.0003$ ). Growth was not significantly different among the isolates at $10{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}(F=3.20$; df $=2,9 ; P=0.0894$ ) (Table 4). Estimated parameter values of the linear and nonlinear models are presented in Table 5. A positive linear relationship was observed between temperature and growth rates for all fungal isolates. Briere- 1 models showed that optimum growth temperatures ranged between 25 and $30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for all isolates (Fig. 3; Table 5). The minimum temperature values generated by both linear regression and Briere-1 models were found to be comparable (Table 5).

## Effect of temperature on virulence of M. anisopliae isolates to aphid species

Mortality of apterous adult B. brassicae, L. pseudobrassicae, and A. gossypii due to the three isolates of M. anisopliae at various constant temperatures is presented in Table 6. Apterous adult B. brassicae were unable to survive at $35^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and was omitted from the analysis. Overall, the mortality of the three apterous adult aphid species was significantly affected by temperature $(F=136.46$; df $=4$, $121 ; P<0.0001)$, fungal isolates $(F=8.55 ; \mathrm{df}=2,121$; $P=0.0003$ ), and aphid species $(F=38.10 ; \mathrm{df}=2,121$; $P<0.0001$ ). Significant interaction between fungal isolate and temperature $(F=2.04 ; \mathrm{df}=8,121 ; P=0.0466)$, isolates and aphid species $(F=3.59 ; \quad \mathrm{df}=4, \quad 121$; $P=0.0084$ ), temperature and aphid species $(F=5.27$; $\mathrm{df}=7,121 ; P<0.0001$ ), and isolates, temperature and aphid species $(F=2.85$; df $=14,121 ; P=0.001)$ were also observed. Across aphid species and fungal isolates, optimum temperature for virulence was found to be $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$


Fig. 1 Conidial production on three apterous adult aphid species: a A. gossypii, b B. brassicae, and $\mathbf{c} L$. pseudobrassicae treated using $1 \times 10^{8}$ conidia ml ${ }^{-1}$ of three isolates of Metarhizium anisopliae at 3 , 6 , and 9 days after treatment. Data present mean $\pm \mathrm{SE}$ at $P<0.05$. Bars indicate SE at $95 \%$ CI
(54.4-91.8 \%) and $30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ (73.4-93.7 \%) although isolate ICIPE 69 caused higher mortality ( 81.7 \%) of B. brassicae at $20^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ (Table 6). At 15 and $20^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, the performance of each of the isolates in terms of virulence across aphid species was rather unique in that none of the isolates achieved comparable level of mortality on the test aphids. For example, isolate ICIPE 30 induced 25.1 and $34.5 \%$ mortality of A. gossypii and B. brassicae, respectively, but performed poorly ( $10.4 \%$ ) on L. pseudobrassicae (Table 6). Similarly, at $20^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, isolate ICIPE 62 caused $69.4 \%$ mortality of B. brassicae and $63.3 \%$ of L. pseudobrassicae but was less virulent to A. gossypii ( $25.0 \%$ ) at


Fig. 2 Effect of temperature on conidial germination of selected isolates of Metarhizium anisopliae. Bars indicate SE at 95 \% CI
the same temperature. However, at the optimum temperature of $25-30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, the three isolates were largely at par in terms of virulence to all the target aphid species (Table 6). The $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ values decreased with increasing temperatures up to $30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. The values were not estimated at $15^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for all the three isolates and at $35^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for ICIPE 30 against $A$. gossypii because mortality was less than $50 \%$ (Table 6). Generally, the shortest $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ values were observed at the optimal temperatures of $25-30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$.

## Screenhouse experiment

Infection by M. anisopliae was observed in all the adult aphid species treated with fungal suspension and collected after spray application and processed in the laboratory. In A. gossypii, mortality in the control treatments was 13.8 and $17.5 \%$ in aqueous and emulsifiable formulations, respectively. In fungus-treated cages, mortality was 72.7 and $93.8 \%$ in aqueous and emulsifiable formulations, respectively (Fig. 4a). In B. brassicae, mortality in the control treatments was 18.8 and $20.0 \%$ in the aqueous and emulsifiable formulations, respectively. In the fungal treatment, mortality was 89.4 and $95.0 \%$ in the aqueous and emulsifiable formulation treatments, respectively (Fig. 4b). For L. pseudobrassicae, control mortality in the controls was 15.0 and $18.8 \%$ in the aqueous and emulsifiable formulations, respectively, while in fungus treatments aphids incurred 90.8 and $85.2 \%$ in the aqueous and emulsifiable formulations, respectively (Fig. 4c).

There was a significant interaction between aphid species and formulations ( $P<0.05$ ). Significant variation was also observed in conidia formulated as aqueous and emulsifiable with regard to mortality on A. gossypii ( $P=0.03$ ) (Fig. 4a). However, in the control treatments, there was no significant difference between aqueous and emulsifiable formulations across the three aphid species ( $P \leq 0.05$ ) (Fig. 4a-c). Mortality induced by conidia formulated in emulsifiable and aqueous formulations on either

Table 4 Effect of temperature on growth rate day ${ }^{-1}$ of selected isolates of $M$. anisopliae cultured on SDA medium

| Isolate | Mean growth rate $\left(\mathrm{mm} \mathrm{day}{ }^{-1}\right) \pm \mathrm{SE}$ |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $10{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | $15^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | $20^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | $30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | $35^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ |
| ICIPE30 | $0.47 \pm 0.02 \mathrm{aD}$ | $1.06 \pm 0.03 \mathrm{bC}$ | $2.03 \pm 0.11 \mathrm{cB}$ | $4.59 \pm 0.13 \mathrm{cA}$ | $4.46 \pm 0.20 \mathrm{cA}$ | $1.01 \pm 0.11 \mathrm{cC}$ |
| ICIPE62 | $0.47 \pm 0.02 \mathrm{aE}$ | $1.44 \pm 0.05 \mathrm{aD}$ | $4.30 \pm 0.14 \mathrm{aC}$ | $8.39 \pm 0.31 \mathrm{aA}$ | $7.54 \pm 0.18 \mathrm{aB}$ | $1.86 \pm 0.06 \mathrm{aD}$ |
| ICIPE69 | $0.58 \pm 0.05 \mathrm{aE}$ | $1.40 \pm 0.11 \mathrm{aD}$ | $3.15 \pm 0.17 \mathrm{bC}$ | $5.98 \pm 0.13 \mathrm{bA}$ | $5.37 \pm 0.16 \mathrm{bB}$ | $1.09 \pm 0.06 \mathrm{bD}$ |

Means within a column followed by the same lower case and within a row followed by the same upper case letters are not significantly different by Tukey's HSD multiple range test $(P=0.05)$

Table 5 Parameter estimates and their approximate standard errors for linear and Brière-1 nonlinear model describing the relationship between temperature and growth of M. anisopliae isolates

| Model | Parameters | Fungal isolates |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  | ICIPE 30 | ICIPE 62 | ICIPE 69 |
| Linear | $a$ | $-2.60 \pm 0.462$ | $-5.68 \pm 0.742$ | $-3.51 \pm 0.481$ |
|  | $b$ | $0.27 \pm 0.03$ | $0.53 \pm 0.04$ | $0.36 \pm 0.03$ |
|  | $T_{\min }$ | $9.63 \pm 0.87$ | $10.66 \pm 0.67$ | $9.75 \pm 0.69$ |
| Briere-1 | $R^{2}$ | 0.89 | 0.93 | 0.93 |
|  | $T_{\min }$ | $9.54 \pm 0.98$ | $9.96 \pm 0.85$ | $8.65 \pm 0.94$ |
|  | $T_{\max }$ | $35.12 \pm 0.06$ | $35.12 \pm 0.05$ | $35.08 \pm 0.04$ |
|  | $T_{\text {opt }}$ | 29.24 | 29.30 | 29.08 |



Fig. 3 Brière-1 model results (curves) describing the relationship between temperature and growth of three icipe fungi isolates. The observed growth values are plotted as points in the same graph
B. brassicae or L. pseudobrassicae were not significantly differ $(P<0.05)$ (Fig. 4b, c).

The average $( \pm \mathrm{SD})$ initial aphid density $\left(N_{0}\right)$ before fungus application was determined by destructive sampling of 5 plants for each species and the results were as follows:
$341.5 \pm 31.0$ for B. brassicae, $509.3 \pm 60.7$ for L. pseudobrassicae, and $251.3 \pm 54.7$ for A. gossypii. The number of aphids per plant declined following application of aqueous and emulsifiable formulations, while it increased in the control treatments for all species (Fig. 5). There was, however, significant variation $(P=0.002)$ between the three aphid species with emulsifiable formulation of conidia. Significant reduction in the number of aphids/plant was observed on the plants sprayed with conidia formulated as aqueous ( $P=0.008$ ) and emulsifiable ( $P<0.001$ ) for A. gossypii. However, there was no significant difference between initial and final aphid numbers/plant in both oil alone ( $P=0.8$ ) and water alone as control treatments ( $P=0.05$ ). On the other hand, variation was observed in the number of aphids/plant in the water control and conidia formulated as emulsifiable ( $P<0.001$ ), water control and conidia formulated as aqueous $(P=0.004)$, and oil control and conidia formulated as emulsifiable $(P<0.001)$. However, there was no significant difference between conidia formulated as emulsifiable and aqueous $(P=0.41)$ (Fig. 5). The $r_{i}$ values of aphid populations were negative following application of the two formulations of M. anisopliae isolate ICIPE 62, while they were positive in the control treatments (Fig. 6). Overall, both conidial formulations had significant effect on aphid population growth compared to the controls $(P<0.05)$ (Fig. 6a-c).

Table 6 Virulence of selected M. anisopliae isolates to apterous adult B. brassicae, L. pseudobrassicae, and A. gossypii: percent mortality $( \pm \mathrm{SE})$ and $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ values 5 days after exposure to $1 \times 10^{8}$ conidia $\mathrm{ml}^{-1}$ under different constant temperatures

| Isolate | Temperature $\left({ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\right)$ | B. brassicae |  | L. pseudobrassicae |  | A. gossypii |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | \% Mortality $\pm$ SE | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{LT}_{50} \text { (day) } \\ & (95 \% \text { FL) } \end{aligned}$ | \% Mortality $\pm$ SE | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{LT}_{50} \text { (day) } \\ & (95 \% \mathrm{FL}) \end{aligned}$ | \% Mortality $\pm$ SE | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{LT}_{50} \text { (day) } \\ & (95 \% \text { FL) } \end{aligned}$ |
| $\begin{gathered} \text { ICIPE } \\ 30 \end{gathered}$ | 15 | $34.5 \pm 7.1 \mathrm{cA}$ | - | $10.4 \pm 2.5 \mathrm{~dB}$ | - | $25.1 \pm 3.5 \mathrm{cAB}$ | - |
|  | 20 | $42.9 \pm 3.7 \mathrm{cA}$ | - | $40.2 \pm 8.3 \mathrm{cA}$ | - | $34.3 \pm 9.3 \mathrm{cA}$ | - |
|  | 25 | $67.4 \pm 7.5 \mathrm{bB}$ | 4.9 (4.8-5.0) | $82.1 \pm 3.4 \mathrm{aA}$ | 3.1 (3.0-3.2) | $66.6 \pm 2.7 \mathrm{abB}$ | 3.9 (3.8-4.0) |
|  | 30 | $81.4 \pm 3.0 \mathrm{aA}$ | 3.8 (3.4-4.1) | $80.3 \pm 5.5 \mathrm{aA}$ | 3.3 (2.9-3.7) | $69.7 \pm 4.0 \mathrm{aB}$ | 3.7 (3.6-3.8) |
|  | 35 | - | - | $62.0 \pm 7.4 \mathrm{bA}$ | 4.1 (4.0-4.3) | $36.8 \pm 10.2 \mathrm{bcB}$ | - |
| $\begin{gathered} \text { ICIPE } \\ 62 \end{gathered}$ | 15 | $33.3 \pm 6.1 \mathrm{cA}$ | - | $3.3 \pm 2.4 \mathrm{~dB}$ | - | $9.2 \pm 7.4 \mathrm{~dB}$ | - |
|  | 20 | $69.4 \pm 2.0 \mathrm{bA}$ | 4.9 (4.3-5.6) | $63.3 \pm 11.1 \mathrm{bcA}$ | 4.3 (3.6-5.1) | $25.0 \pm 5.3 \mathrm{cB}$ | - |
|  | 25 | $91.8 \pm 3.9 \mathrm{aA}$ | 3.5 (3.3-3.7) | $77.0 \pm 3.8 \mathrm{bB}$ | 4.1 (3.9-4.2) | $65.7 \pm 4.6 \mathrm{bB}$ | 4.8 (4.5-5.1) |
|  | 30 | $89.6 \pm 4.3 \mathrm{aA}$ | 2.6 (2.4-2.8) | $89.7 \pm 2.1 \mathrm{aA}$ | 2.8 (2.5-3.1) | $87.2 \pm 1.9 \mathrm{aA}$ | 3.0 (2.9-3.1) |
|  | 35 | - | - | $49.4 \pm 3.3 \mathrm{cA}$ | - | $56.3 \pm 8.2 \mathrm{bA}$ | 4.7 (4.1-4.9) |
| $\begin{gathered} \text { ICIPE } \\ 69 \end{gathered}$ | 15 | $27.5 \pm 8.4 \mathrm{cA}$ | - | $5.6 \pm 9.2 \mathrm{fB}$ | - | $17.7 \pm 2.9 \mathrm{cA}$ | - |
|  | 20 | $81.7 \pm 3.9 \mathrm{bA}$ | 5.3 (4.8-5.7) | $44.9 \pm 6.3 \mathrm{eB}$ | - | $16.0 \pm 0.7 \mathrm{cC}$ | - |
|  | 25 | $78.3 \pm 7.5 \mathrm{bA}$ | 2.8 (2.3-3.3) | $70.0 \pm 5.9 \mathrm{bA}$ | 3.7 (3.5-3.8) | $54.4 \pm 3.9 \mathrm{bB}$ | 4.6 (4.5-4.8) |
|  | 30 | $93.7 \pm 2.3 \mathrm{aA}$ | 2.3 (2.0-2.7) | $83.9 \pm 3.8 \mathrm{aAB}$ | 3.1 (2.0-3.3) | $73.4 \pm 4.7 \mathrm{aB}$ | 3.4 (3.0-3.7) |
|  | 35 | - | - | $57.3 \pm 3.0 \mathrm{dA}$ | 4.4 (4.1-4.7) | $60.6 \pm 8.8 \mathrm{abA}$ | 4.5 (4.3-4.7) |

Means within a column followed by the same lower case and within a row followed by the same upper case letters are not significantly different by Tukey's HSD multiple range test ( $P=0.05$ ). Values presented here were subjected to Abbott's correction before analysis. Values in the bracket represent $95 \%$ Fiducial Limits. Dash $(-)$ means the $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ value was not estimated for cumulative mortality less than $50 \%$ at 5 days posttreatment, and also there are no data on B. brassicae at $35^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$

## Discussion

All the fungal isolates tested were pathogenic to B. brassicae, L. pseudobrassicae, and A. gossypii. However, M. anisopliae isolates ICIPE 30, ICIPE 62, and ICIPE 69 were virulent to $B$. brassicae and L. pseudobrassicae as compared to A. gossypii. Isolates of B. bassiana were the least virulent against the three aphid species, except isolate ICIPE 279 which was virulent against A. gossypii. These results confirm the pathogenicity of B. bassiana and M. anisopliae toward aphids as reported by other workers. For example, mortality of $100 \%$ was reported in thirdinstar nymphs of Myzus persicae (Sulz.) and A. gossypii by B. bassiana and M. anisopliae (Loureiro and Moino 2006). Similarly, Jandricic et al. (2014) identified a number of isolates of Beauveria and Metarhizium virulent to first-instar nymphs of A. gossypii and M. persicae following the screening of 44 fungal isolates and 4 commercially available strains. Variation in the virulence of fungal isolates has been reported on many groups of arthropods such as fruit flies (Dimbi et al. 2003), thrips (Ekesi et al. 1998; Niassy et al. 2012), two-spotted spider mite (Bugeme et al. 2009), red spider mite (Wekesa et al. 2005), and leafminer (Migiro et al. 2010). For example, M. anisopliae ICIPE 62, which was found to be virulent against the three species of
aphids in the present study, was also reported to be virulent against Ceratitis rosa var. fasciventris (Karsch) and C. cosyra (Walker) (Diptera: Tephritidae) (Dimbi et al. 2003) and adult Cylas puncticollis Boheman (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) (Ondiaka et al. 2008) but less pathogenic to adult Ceratitis capitata (Weidemann) and Tetranychus evansi Baker and Pritchard (Acari: Tetranychidae) (Bugeme et al. 2008). Given the fast developmental period of aphids and the rather short window of opportunity for infection due to ecdysis, the speed of kill becomes essential. In addition to causing high mortalities, M. anisopliae isolates ICIPE 30, ICIPE 62, and ICIPE 69 had the shortest $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ values compared to the other isolates against the three aphid species tested. The $\mathrm{LC}_{50}$ values varied with aphid species, with A. gossypii generally having the highest values, which is an indication that this species is less susceptible to fungal infection by isolates tested.

The identification of fungal isolates with proven efficacy against a broad range of aphid species should be a logical approach for the management of aphid on diverse crops, considering that most of them occupy the same ecological niche than strict specificity to one species. This assertion is in agreement with Jandricic et al. (2014) who stated that the ideal mycoinsecticide for aphid management should be more consistent, with broader activity against a variety of


Fig. 4 Percent mortality of apterous adults of a A. gossypii, b B. brassicae, and c L. pseudobrassicae collected from screenhouse and processed in the laboratory 7 days post-treatment with conidia of Metarhizium anisopliae ICIPE 62 formulated in emulsifiable (EPF + Oil) and aqueous (EPF + Water) formulations, and oil alone and water alone. Bars indicate means SE at 95 \% CI. Means followed by the same letter indicate no significant differences between treatments by Tukey's HSD multiple range test at $P$ values of $<0.05$
aphid species than the existing products that are relatively targeted at one species. In this regard, the three M. anisopliae isolates (ICIPE 30, ICIPE 62, and ICIPE 69) are potential candidates for development as biopesticides against the target aphid species compared to the other isolates tested in this study.

In addition to virulence, the three isolates of M. anisopliae were evaluated for conidial production on aphid


Fig. 5 Average number of aphids/plant before treatment (initial) and 7 days after treated with conidia of Metarhizium anisopliae ICIPE 62 formulated in aqueous (EPF + Water) and oil (EPF + Oil), oil alone, and water alone. Bars indicate means SE at 95 \% CI
cadavers, and isolate ICIPE 62 was proven to produce high number of conidia on the three aphid species. The conidiation potential of isolate ICIPE 62 on the three aphid species observed in the present study is similar to the one reported with M. anisopliae isolates on M. persicae reported by Shan and Feng (2010).

Conidial germination and mycelial growth of the isolates were observed at all temperature tested with the optimum temperature of growth occurring at 25 and $30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, which is in agreement with previous published reports (Bugeme et al. 2008; Dimbi et al. 2004; Ekesi et al. 1999; Fargues et al. 1992; Ouedraogo et al. 1997).

Mortality of the three apterous adult aphid species was significantly affected by temperature, fungal isolates, and aphid species. However, the optimal temperatures for virulence to the three aphid species were 25 and $30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ which corresponded to optimal temperatures for germination and radial growth. While evaluating the effect of temperature on virulence of isolates of B. bassiana and M. anisopliae to T. urticae, Bugeme et al. (2009) observed that both fungal species were virulent at 25,30 , and $35^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ than at $20^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. A correlation between optimum temperature for fungal growth and fungal infection has been reported by different authors (Bugeme et al. 2008; Ekesi et al. 1999; Maniania and Fargues 1992). Although fungal infection significantly slowed at temperature of $20^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, this did not affect the overall cumulative mortality caused by isolates ICIPE 62 and 69. Thermotolerance of M. anisopliae isolate ICIPE 62 to broad temperature range compares favorably with prevailing temperatures under which the three aphid species thrive. M. anisopliae isolate ICIPE 62 is therefore suitable candidate for development as biopesticide for the control of the three species of aphids. Both aqueous and emulsifiable formulations of $M$. anisopliae isolate ICIPE 62 significantly reduced populations of B. brassicae, L. pseudobrassicae, and A. gossypii


Fig. 6 Instantaneous rate of increase of three aphid species. a $A$. gossypii, b B. brassicae, and (c) L. pseudobrassicae 7 days after treated with conidia of Metarhizium anisopliae ICIPE 62 formulated in aqueous (EPF + Water) and oil (EPF + Oil), oil alone, and water alone. Bars indicate means SE at $95 \%$ CI. Means followed by the same letter indicate no significant differences between treatments by Tukey's HSD multiple range test at $P$ values of $<0.05$
in the screenhouse experiments. There were no significant between the two formulations, except in A. gossypii where emulsifiable formulation performed better. The mechanism underlying for the enhanced in efficacy of emulsifiable formulation on A. gossypii is probably due to less waxy layer on this particular aphid species which could promote conidia attachments. This is attributed to prevention of conidia from desiccation, increased adhesion, and spread of inoculum over the host cuticle and into crevices (Ibrahim et al. 1999).

Emulsifiable oil used as a control had no effect on population growth of the aphid species, indicating no toxic effect on the target aphids. This suggests a reduction in population growth from both adults' mortality and reduction in fecundity following the application of conidial formulations as previously reported by Jandricic et al. (2014). Among the two formulations, emulsifiable formulation performed better in terms of lower $r_{i}$ values on A. gossypii compared to the conidia formulated as aqueous, but there was no significant difference in terms of this parameter on B. brassicae and L. pseudobrassicae. The lack of significant difference between the two formulations observed in the present study on B. brassicae and L. pseudobrassicae may be related to the waxy cuticle layer of the two aphid species. Brevicoryne brassicae and L. pseudobrassicae possess long, stilt-like legs and waxed cuticle that could minimize body contact with leaf surface reducing the likelihood of the aphids acquiring lethal dose of inoculum from treated leaf surfaces. Nevertheless, recent studies by Amnuaykanjanasin et al. (2013) showed that conidia may germinate and penetrate the aphid cuticle most efficiently on the inter-segmental membranes at the proximal end of the legs (close to the body's ventral surface) and this may have contributed to high impact of isolate ICIPE 62 on the highly waxed aphid species. A high proportion of the three aphid species collected from the treated plants were mycosed by M. anisopliae, which is an indication of the effects of fungal treatments.

This study has identified M. anisopliae isolate ICIPE 62 as potential candidate for further development as biopesticide for the control of the three aphid species based on the following desirable traits: virulence against the three target aphid pests, high conidial production, speed of kill $\left(\mathrm{LT}_{50}\right)$, lower $\mathrm{LC}_{50}$ values, and efficacy across a broad range of temperatures (Yeo et al. 2003). In addition, since aphids usually form large colonies on plant surfaces, the isolate of M. anisopliae ICIPE 62 profusely sporulated on dead aphids and could serve as source of inoculum for infection of healthy aphids which may lead to acute mortality. The potential of this isolate was further confirmed in screenhouse experiments against mixed stages of the targeted aphid species. This isolate could be therefore integrated with other control agents such as predators (coccinellids and syrphids) and parasitoids (Diaeretiella rapae (M'Cintosh) which have been observed attacking B. brassicae and Aphidius colemani Viereck attacking A. gossypii) (Bayissa et al. 2016; Ekesi unpublished data). Additional studies are underway to examine the interactions with these beneficial organisms. However, further field evaluation will be required to validate these results as part of an integrated management package for the aphid pests on crucifers and okra.

## Author contribution

WB, SE, and SAM conceived and designed research. WB conducted the experiments. SE, NKM, SAM, and RH contributed reagents/materials/analysis tools. WB analyzed the data. WB, SE, NKM, SAM, GPK, and JMW wrote the manuscript. All authors read and approved the manuscript.

Acknowledgments The first author received a PhD fellowship stipend from the German Academic Exchange Service/Deutcher Akademischer Austausch Dienst (DAAD) through the African Regional Postgraduate Programme in Insect Science (ARPPIS) of icipe. Operational research activities was funded by German Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) through a joint International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA)/icipe/World Vegetable Centre/Friedrich-Schiller-University of Jena project on "Enhancing horticultural productivity, incomes and livelihoods through integrated management of aphid pests on vegetables in subSaharan Africa." The authors are thankful for statistical advice of Mr. Benedict Orindi and Dr. Daisy Salifu and technical assistance of Mr. Peterson Nderitu and Mr. Gordon Otieno.

## References

Abbott W (1925) A method of computing the effectiveness of an insecticide. J Econ Entomol 18:265-267
Aktar W, Sengupta D, Chowdhury A (2009) Impact of pesticides use in agriculture: their benefits and hazards. Interdiscp Toxicol 2:1-12
Amnuaykanjanasin A, Jirakkakul J, Panyasiri C, Panyarakkit P, Nounurai P, Chantasingh D, Eurwilaichitr L, Cheevadhanarak S, Tanticharoen M (2013) Infection and colonization of tissues of the aphid Myzus persicae and cassava mealybug Phenacoccus manihoti by the fungus Beauveria bassiana. BioControl 58:379-391
Amoabeng BW, Gurr GM, Gitau CW, Nicol HI, Munyakazi L, Stevenson PC (2013) Tri-trophic insecticidal effects of African plants against cabbage pests. PLoS One 8:e78651
Banken J (1996) An ecotoxicological assessment of the neem insecticide, Neemix, on the pea aphid (Acyrthosiphon pisum Harris) and the seven-spot lady beetle (Coccinella septempunctata L.). Washington State University
Bayissa W, Ekesi S, Mohamed SA, Kaaya GP, Wagacha JR, Hanna M, Maniania NK (2016) Interactions among vegetable-infesting aphids, the fungal pathogen Metarhizium anisopliae (Ascomycota: Hypocreales) and the predatory coccinellid Cheilomenes lunata (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae). Biocontrol Sci Technol 26:274-290
Benz (1987) Environment. In: Fuxa JR, Tanada Y (eds) Epizootiology of insect diseases. Wiley, New York, pp 177-214
Birch LC (1948) The intrinsic rate of natural increase of an insect population. J Anim Ecol 17:15-26
Briere JF, Pracros P, Le Roux AY, Pierre JS (1999) A novel rate model of temperature-dependent development for arthropods. Environ Entomol 28:22-29
Bugeme DM, Maniania NK, Knapp M, Boga HI (2008) Effect of temperature on virulence of Beauveria bassiana and Metarhizium anisopliae isolates to Tetranychus evansi. Exp Appl Acarol 46:275-285
Bugeme DM, Knapp M, Boga HI, Wanjoya AK, Maniania NK (2009) Influence of temperature on virulence of fungal isolates of Metarhizium anisopliae and Beauveria bassiana to the two-
spotted spider mite Tetranychus urticae. Mycopathol 167:221-227
Burgerjon A (1956) Pulvérisation de poudrage au laboratoire par des préparations pathogèènes insecticides. Annales des Epiphyties 4:677-688
Campbell A, Frazer BD, Gilbert NE, Gutierrez AP, Mackauer M (1974) Temperature requirements of some aphids and their parasites. J Appl Entomol 11:431-438
Cherry AJ, Gwynn RL (2007) Perspectives on the development of biological control agents in Africa. Biocontrol Sci Technol 17:665-676
Davidson G, Phelps K, Sunderland K, Pell J, Ball B, Shaw K, Chandler D (2003) Study of temperature-growth interactions of entomopathogenic fungi with potential for control of Varroa destructor (Acari: Mesostigmata) using a nonlinear model of poikilotherm development. J Appl Microbiol 94:816-825
Dimbi S, Maniania NK, Lux SA, Ekesi S, Mueke JK (2003) Pathogenicity of Metarhizium anisopliae (Metsch.) Sorokin and Beauveria bassiana (Balsamo) Vuillemin, to three adult fruit fly species: Ceratitis capitata (Weidemann), C. rosa var. fasciventris Karsch and C. cosyra (Walker) (Diptera: Tephritidae). Mycopathol 156:375-382
Dimbi S, Maniania NK, Lux SA, Mueke JM (2004) Effect of constant temperatures on germination, radial growth and virulence of Metarhizium anisopliae to three species of African tephritid fruit flies. BioCon 49:83-94
Ekesi S, Maniania N, Onu I, Löhr B (1998) Pathogenicity of entomopathogenic fungi (Hyphomycetes) to the legume flower thrips, Megalurothrips sjostedti (Trybom)(Thysan., Thripidae). J Appl Entomol 122:629-634
Ekesi S, Maniania N, Ampong-Nyarko K (1999) Effect of temperature on germination, radial growth and virulence of Metarhizium anisopliae and Beauveria bassiana on Megalurothrips sjostedti. Biocontrol Sci Technol 9:177-185
Fargues J, Bon MC (2004) Influence of temperature preferences of two Paecilomyces fumosoroseus lineages on their co-infection pattern. J Invertebr Pathol 87:94-104
Fargues J, Maniania N, Delmas J, Smits N (1992) Influence de la température sur la croissance in vitro d'hyphomycètes entomopathogènes. Agronomie 12:557-564
Gomez KA, Gomez AA (1984) Statistical procedures for agricultural research. Wiley, New York
Hall R, Papierok B (1982) Fungi as biological control agents of arthropods of agricultural and medical importance. Parasitol 84:205-240
Hesketh H, Roy H, Eilenberg J, Pell J, Hails R (2010) Challenges in modelling complexity of fungal entomopathogens in seminatural populations of insects. BioCon 55:55-73
Ibrahim L, Butt T, Beckett A, Clark S (1999) The germination of oilformulated conidia of the insect pathogen, Metarhizium anisopliae. Mycol Res 103:901-907
Inglis GD, Goettel MS, Butt TM, Strasser H (2001) Use of hyphomycetous fungi for managing insect pests. In: Butt TM, Jackson C, Magan N (eds) Fungi as biocontrol agents: progress, problems and potential. CAB International, Wallingford, pp 23-69
Jandricic S, Filotas M, Sanderson J, Wraight S (2014) Pathogenicity of conidia-based preparations of entomopathogenic fungi against the greenhouse pest aphids Myzus persicae, Aphis gossypii, and Aulacorthum solani (Hemiptera: Aphididae). J Invertebr Pathol 118:34-46
Kabaluk, JT, Svircev, AM, Goettel, MS, Woo, SG (eds) (2010) The use and regulation of microbial pesticides in representative jurisdictions worldwide. Retrieved from http://www.iobcglobal. org/publications.html\#microbial_regulation_book

Loureiro EdS, Moino A Jr (2006) Pathogenicity of hyphomycet fungi to aphids Aphis gossypii Glover and Myzus persicae (Sulzer)(Hemiptera: Aphididae). Neotrop Entomol 35:660-665
Maniania NK (1993) Evaluation of three formulations of Beauveria bassiana (Bals.) Vuill. for control of the stem borer Chilo partellus (Swinhoe) (Lep., Pyralidae). J Appl Entomol 115:266-272
Maniania NK, Fargues J (1992) Susceptibility of Mamestra brassicae (L.), and Spodoptera littoralis (Boisd.) larvae (Lep., Noctuidae) to the Hyphomycetes Paecilomyces fumosoroseus (Brown and Smith) and Nomuraea rileyi (Samson) at two temperatures. J Appl Entomol 113:518-524
Migiro L, Maniania N, Chabi-Olaye A, Vandenberg J (2010) Pathogenicity of entomopathogenic fungi Metarhizium anisopliae and Beauveria bassiana (Hypocreales: Clavicipitaceae) isolates to the adult pea leafminer (Diptera: Agromyzidae) and prospects of an autoinoculation device for infection in the field. Environ Entomol 39:468-475
Moore D, Prior C (1993) The potential of mycoinsecticides. Biocontrol News Inf 14:31-40
Niassy S, Maniania N, Subramanian S, Gitonga L, Mburu D, Masiga D, Ekesi S (2012) Selection of promising fungal biological control agent of the western flower thrips Frankliniella occidentalis (Pergande). Lett Appl Microbiol 54:487-493
Nyambo B, Löhr B (2005) The role and significance of farmer participation in biocontrol-based IPM for brassica crops in East Africa. In: Hoddle, MS (ed), Proceedings of the second international symposium on biological control of arthropod, 12-16 September 2005, pp. 290-301. USDA forest service publication FHTET-2005-08, Davos, Switzerland
Ondiaka S, Maniania N, Nyamasyo G, Nderitu J (2008) Virulence of the entomopathogenic fungi Beauveria bassiana and Metarhizium anisopliae to sweet potato weevil Cylas puncticollis and effects on fecundity and egg viability. Ann Appl Biol 153:41-48
Oruku L, Ndung'u B (2001) Final socio-economic report for the periurban vegetable IPM thematic cluster. CAB International, Africa Regional Centre Report, Nairobi 49
Ouedraogo A, Fargues J, Goettel M, Lomer C (1997) Effect of temperature on vegetative growth among isolates of Metarhizium anisopliae and M. flavoviride. Mycopathol 137:37-43
Ravensberg W J (2011) A roadmap to the successful development and commercialization of microbial pest control products for control of arthropods. Springer Science \& Business Media
R Development Core Team (2011) R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R foundation for statistical computing, Vienna, Austria. http://www.R-project.org
Sæthre M-G, Godonou I, Hofsvang T, Tepa-Yotto G, James B (2011) Aphids and their natural enemies in vegetable agroecosystems in Benin. Int J Trop Insect Sci 31:103-117
SAS Institute (1999-2001) SAS/STAT User's Guide, Version. SAS Institute Inc, Cary, NC

SAS Institute (1999-2001) SAS/STAT User's Guide, Version 8.01. Cary, NC, USA: SAS Institute Inc
Shan LT, Feng MG (2010) Evaluation of the biocontrol potential of various Metarhizium isolates against green peach aphid Myzus persicae (Homoptera: Aphididae). Pest Manag Sci 66:669-675
Sithanantham S, Ampong-Nyarko K, Seshu-Reddy K, AmpongNyarko K, Varla A, Maniania N, Lako G, Baumgartner J (1997) IPM for export vegetables. ICIPE Science Press, Nairobi
Spence N, Phiri N, Hughes S, Mwaniki A, Simons S, Oduor G, Chacha D, Kuria A, Ndirangu S, Kibata G (2007) Economic impact of Turnip mosaic virus, Cauliflower mosaic virus and Beet mosaic virus in three Kenyan vegetables. Plant Pathol 56:317-323
Stark JD, Banks JE (2003) Population-level effects of pesticides and other toxicants on arthropods. Ann Rev Entomol 48:505-519
Stokes ME, Davis CS, Koch GG (2000) Categorical data using the SAS system. SAS Institute Inc, Cary NC
Throne JE, Weaver DK, Chew V, Baker JE (1995) Probit analysis of correlated data: multiple observations over time at one concentration. J Econ Entomol 88:1510-1512
Van Emden HF, Harrington R (2007) Aphids as crop pests. CAB Iternational, Wallingford
Waiganjo M, Waturu C, Mureithi J, Muriuki J, Kamau J, Munene R (2011) Use of entomopathogenic fungi and neem bio-pesticides for Brassica pests control and conservation of their natural enemies. East Afr Agric Forestry J 77:545-549
Walthall WK, Stark JD (1997) Comparison of two population-level ecotoxicological endpoints: The intrinsic (rm) and instantaneous (ri) rates of increase. Environ Toxicol Chem 16:1068-1073
Wekesa VW, Maniania NK, Knapp M, Boga HI (2005) Pathogenicity of Beauveria bassiana and Metarhizium anisopliae to the tobacco spider mite Tetranychus evansi. Exp Appl Acarol 36:41-50
Williamson S, Ball A, Pretty J (2008) Trends in pesticide use and drivers for safer pest management in four African countries Crop Protec 27:1327-1334
Wraight SP, Hajek AE (2009) Manipulation of arthropod pathogens for IPM. Concepts, tactics, strategies and case studies. In: Radcliffe EB, Hutchison WD and Cancelado RE (eds) integrated pest management, Cambridge University Press pp. 131-150
Yeo H, Pell JK, Alderson PG, Clark SJ, Pye BJ (2003) Laboratory evaluation of temperature effects on the germination and growth of entomopathogenic fungi and on their pathogenicity to two aphid species. Pest Manag Sci 59:156-165
Zalucki M, Shabbir A, Silva R, Adamson D, Furlong M, Shu-sheng L (2012) Estimating the economic cost of one of the world's major insect pests, Plutella xylostella (Lepidoptera : Plutellidae): just how long is a piece of string? Econ Entomol 105:1115-1129


[^0]:    W. Bayissa
    wakumab@gmail.com
    1 International Centre of Insect Physiology and Ecology (ICIPE), Nairobi, Kenya
    2 School of Biological Sciences, University of Nairobi, Nairobi, Kenya
    3 International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA), Yaoundé, Cameroon

[^1]:    ${ }^{\text {a }}$ Viability of conidia on SDA plates after 18 h at $26 \pm 2{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. Means within a column followed by the same letter are not significantly different by Tukey's HSD multiple range test at $5 \%$ level

[^2]:    Means within a row followed by the same lower case and within column upper case letters do not differ significantly by Tukey's HSD multiple range test $(P=0.05) . \mathrm{LT}_{50}$ (in days) $\pm 95 \%$ fiducially limit $(\mathrm{FL})$. The $\mathrm{LT}_{50}$ value for isolate ICIPE 279 was not computed against $L$. pseudobrassicae since mortality was less than $50 \%$ at 7 days post-treatment

